

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 10th  
January, 2017 at 2.00 pm

**PRESENT:** County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)  
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: D. Blakebrough, R. Chapman, D. Dovey,  
R. Harris, B. Hayward, J. Higginson, P. Murphy, M. Powell,  
B. Strong, A. Webb and A. Wintle.

### OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Mark Hand	Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Paula Clarke	Planning Applications and Enforcement Manager
Robert Tranter	Head of Legal Services & Monitoring Officer
Shirley Wiggam	Senior Strategy and Policy Officer
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

### APOLOGIES:

County Councillors D. Edwards, D. Evans and P. Watts

#### 1. Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest made by Members.

#### 2. Confirmation of minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee Meeting dated 6<sup>th</sup> December 2016 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

#### 3. APPLICATION DC/2015/00972 - CONSTRUCTION OF 8 DWELLINGS (3 AFFORDABLE UNITS AND 5 MARKET HOUSES). LAND ADJACENT TO WALNUT TREE COTTAGE, NEWPORT ROAD, LLANGYBI

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the 10 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement requesting that three of the units be affordable units and passed on to a social housing provider.

In noting the detail of the application, Members were reminded that the application had been presented to Planning Committee at its meeting on 6<sup>th</sup> December 2016 with a recommendation for refusal. The decision regarding the application had been deferred in order to consider amendments to the proposed layout and design of development.

Amended plans have now been submitted showing alterations to the design of the residential units and with an amended layout showing a less engineered access

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 10th January, 2017 at 2.00 pm**

roadway and a more rational parking arrangement. Amendments have also been made to the two flats on plots 5 and 6. The entrance has been relocated to the northern side of the building and there is now a covered stairway. There are now only two windows on the north-east elevation (facing towards Llangybi House) and these both serve a bathroom.

Councillor J. Love, representing Llangybi Community Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The Community Council regrets that no proper site inspection had been held. Community Councillors arrived on the December date only to learn of the postponement pending the submission of requested amendments.
- Committee Members did not go to the site to obtain a clearer picture of the locations features.
- The Community Council's key concerns could not be demonstrated in their actual context.
- The County Council's Heritage Officer contends that the lowest, most easterly part of Llangybi has a distinctively different, unique character bordered by the narrow historical country Ynys Lane, with several listed buildings, a Grade II\* listed church with unique wall painting, very susceptible to earth vibrations, two church yards and a Cadw scheduled ancient holy well. All of which will be seriously diminished by the closeness and density of the development.
- The green view of Llangybi from Wentwood across the ancient water meadows will be spoilt and the Community Council predicts that future potential residents on this site will either complain about flooding or the ringing of eight church bells.
- What also makes the plans inappropriate is the over dominance of the five large market value properties with the too few affordable properties being unattractive in design with the proposed three properties actually being just one small block with two semi-detached one bedroom flats and one other, none with any garaging.
- The 2014 Community Led Plan commits the Community Council to supporting residents' wishes for more affordable housing, but for no further large market value housing, yet this proposed development makes little more than token gestures towards affordability.
- The Community Council's other major concern is the access onto a very busy, dangerous main road. One which when approved in 2012 was for two vehicles to the cottage but could now see many more using it, possibly 10 times the expected volume.
- No proposed visibility splays can disguise the fact that from the Usk direction, the bend next to the south western edge of Walnut Tree Cottage totally conceals the

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 10th January, 2017 at 2.00 pm

proposed access within a few yards of that corner. This road has already claimed one fatality and several serious accidents. The Community Speed Watch sessions and Police camera van have indicated the increase in the volume of traffic. Since September 2016, Speed Watch has reported over 50 vehicles exceeding the 30mph limit, mostly heading towards Caerleon.

- The applicant's offer of £10,000 towards traffic calming measures is not practical due to the amount and size of vehicles driving through the village.
- The right of way from the village to the public footpath at the top of the hill towards Tredunnoc will be affected by the visibility splays, harming the walkers' approach from Caerleon and endangering the one from Llangybi.
- Highways has concerns regarding rights of ways, advising that the application not be approved until these matters have been addressed.
- The Local Development Plan criteria defines Llangybi as a main village suitable for further development. This is untenable as the shop and post office have been closed for over a year.
- The poor, at risk bus service is no use to the non-car owning residents needing to commute to Cardiff for their work.
- The Community Council considers that enough large developments have taken place in Llangybi and therefore ask the Planning Committee to consider refusal of the application.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The amended plans are a vast improvement compared to the original plans.
- The detail of the application needs to be referred to the Delegation Panel.
- The Section 106 funding in the sum of £10,000 for traffic management improvements could be used to provide permanent flashing 30mph signs at the beginning and exit to the village.
- Affordable housing is needed in the village.

The local Member for Llangybi, also a Planning Committee Member, considered that the proposed dwelling with the external staircase, required the roofline to be increased. The Delegated Panel could look carefully at this matter with a view to finding an appropriate solution.

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor P. Clarke and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2015/00972 be approved subject to the 10 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 10th January, 2017 at 2.00 pm

requesting that three of the units be affordable units and passed on to a social housing provider. Also, subject to the amended design of the walk in flats being approved via the Delegated Panel (Plots 5 and 6).

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/00972 be approved subject to the 10 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement requesting that three of the units be affordable units and passed on to a social housing provider. Also, subject to the amended design of the walk in flats being approved via the Delegated Panel (Plots 5 and 6).

#### **4. APPLICATION DC/2013/00571 - OUTLINE PLANNING PERMISSION WITH ALL MATTERS RESERVED, EXCEPT FOR ACCESS, FOR UP TO 200 DWELLINGS. LAND TO THE WEST OF A466 AND SOUTH OF MOUNTON ROAD, CHEPSTOW**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was presented for refusal for the four reasons, as outlined in the report, with the additional reason for refusal, as outlined in late correspondence.

The local Member for St. Kingsmark, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed his support for the officer recommendation to refuse the application for the reasons outlined.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, Members also expressed their support for the officer recommendation to refuse the application for the reasons outlined.

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R. Hayward that application DC/2013/00571 be refused for the four reasons, as outlined in the report, with the additional reason for refusal, as outlined in late correspondence.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	13
Against refusal	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

**MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 10th  
January, 2017 at 2.00 pm**

We resolved that application DC/2013/00571 be refused for the four reasons, as outlined in the report, with the additional reason for refusal, as outlined in late correspondence.

**5. APPLICATION DC/2015/01588 - CONVERSION WITH ALTERATIONS AND EXTENSIONS TO FORMER GALLERY TO PROVIDE 2 NO. DWELLINGS. THE OLD SMITHY, 34 MARYPORT STREET, USK, NP15 1AE**

We considered the report of the application which was presented for refusal for the one reason, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, Members were reminded that Planning Committee had been minded to refuse the application at its meeting on 6th December 2016 and that it be re-presented to the Committee with appropriate reasons for refusal.

Having considered the report of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor B. Strong and seconded by County Councillor P. Clarke that application DC/2015/01588 be refused for the one reason, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	13
Against refusal	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01588 be refused for the one reason, as outlined in the report.

**6. APPLICATION - DC/2016/00287 AN EXTENSION TO BEAULIEU BARN TO PROVIDE A SUITABLE INTERNAL VOLUME TO PROVIDE FOR A MODERN STANDARD OF RESIDENTIAL LIVING ACCOMMODATION. BEAULIEU BARN, 25 KYMIN ROAD, THE KYMIN, MONMOUTH, NP25 3SD**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, Members were reminded that the Planning Committee had been minded to approve the application at its meeting on 6th December 2016 and that it be re-presented to the Committee for approval with appropriate conditions.

Having considered the report of the application, the majority of the Committee expressed their support for the application with the conditions outlined. However, some Members reiterated that the application was contrary to planning policy and they could not support approval of the application.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 10th January, 2017 at 2.00 pm

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R.J. Higginson that application DC/2016/00287 be approved subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	9
Against approval	-	3
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00287 be approved subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report.

**7. APPLICATION DC/2016/00322 - CONSTRUCTION OF UNIT 6 (BEING FINAL STAGE OF OVERALL DEVELOPMENT SCHEME FOR THE RETENTION OF EXISTING BUILDERS YARD AND REPLACEMENT OF EXISTING BUILDINGS - DC/2013/00367) COMPRISING DETACHED SINGLE STOREY UNIT (12.6M X 11.1M X 4M TO EAVES). THE BUILDERS YARD, CHEPSTOW ROAD, USK, NP15 1HN**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Usk, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed his support for the application.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, it was proposed by County Councillor B. Strong and seconded by County Councillor P. Clarke that application DC/2016/00322 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00322 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 10th  
January, 2017 at 2.00 pm

### **8. APPLICATION DC/2016/00388 - CONVERSION OF A REDUNDANT FARM BUILDING INTO ANCILLARY RESIDENTIAL ACCOMMODATION. MILL FARM, DINGESTOW, NP25 4DY**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Having considered the report of the application it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R. J. Higginson that application DC/2016/00388 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00388 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

### **9. Appeal decision - Caxton Tower**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to two appeal decisions following a site visit that had been made on 25<sup>th</sup> October 2016.

**Appeal A – App. E6840/C/16/3154351 - Site: Land at Caxton Tower, Newbolds Farm, Rockfield, Monmouth, Monmouthshire, NP25 5SY.**

1. The appeal is allowed on grounds (f) and (g), and the enforcement notice is varied: by the deletion of the requirement in Schedule 4 and the substitution of the requirement.

“Partially demolish the outbuilding by removing the roof and lowering the walls to the eaves levels specified on Drawing No. 1233-02c, as approved under planning permission ref DC/2013/00623, and remove from the land any surplus materials not required to complete the outbuilding in accordance with that Drawing; and by the deletion of 3 calendar months and the substitution of 6 calendar months as the Time for Compliance.

2. Subject to these variations the enforcement notice is upheld and planning permission is refused on the application deemed to have been made under section 177(5) of the 1990 Act as amended.

**Appeal B App. /E6840/A/16/3154336 – Site: Caxton Tower, Newbolds Farm, Rockfield, Monmouth, NP25 5SY.**

The appeal had been dismissed.

**MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 10th  
January, 2017 at 2.00 pm**

**10. Appeal Decision - Chapel Road, Abergavenny**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been made on 14th December 2016. Site: 109A Chapel Road, Abergavenny, NP7 &DR.

The appeal had been dismissed.

**11. Appeal decision - The Old Coach House, Llanishen**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been made on 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2016. Site: Land adjoining Old Coach House, Llanishen, Chepstow, NP16 6QH.

The appeal had been dismissed.

**The meeting ended at 2.56 pm**